

Seminar in International Politics: Self-Determination

Instructor: Anne-Marie Gardner

Fall 2004

Course description

Self-determination is a battle cry for more than 100 groups around the globe, including Quebec, Scotland, Aceh, and Tibet. Many of these claims have erupted into violent conflict or have the potential to cause regional instability—witness Northern Ireland, Chechnya, the Spanish Basque region, Kashmir, and the Israeli-Palestinian conflict. The claimant group often seeks redress or resolution of the claim through international organizations, propelling ostensibly domestic issues onto the international agenda. In response, the international community has devoted a vast amount of resources to resolving these claims—UN peacekeeping missions in Kosovo, East Timor, and Western Sahara; other conflict resolution efforts in Nagorno-Karabakh, Cyprus, and Sri Lanka; and conflict prevention efforts through institutions like the OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities. How should we understand these claims in International Relations?

This course will examine the complexities of contemporary self-determination claims in order to provide the tools for developing comprehensive resolution strategies. We will explore historical, legal, ethical, and political dimensions of self-determination claims, with particular emphasis on changing conceptions of sovereignty, borders, and identity. What is self-determination—who is the ‘self’ and what are they ‘determining’? How has this definition changed over time—and what are the implications of this evolution for outcomes? How could and should the international community address these claims? We will apply theoretical lenses to three case studies, trying to isolate the political, ethical, and legal aspects of claims as well as highlighting interactive effects among these dilemmas in each case.

Assignments:

Students will be expected to complete the assigned readings and engage in class discussion each week. They will frequently be asked to contribute discussion questions about the readings or to complete brief (1 page) assignments prior to class. In addition, there are two written components of the course:

- A short (5 page) response paper offering a critical analysis of the assigned readings for a chosen week. The paper will be due at the beginning of class on the day we discuss the relevant readings. Students will help lead discussion on the day they turn in their response paper.
- A longer (15 page) final paper due on Dean’s Date. This research paper will demonstrate the students’ ability to apply the course material to the context of a particular self-determination claim. Students will design and describe a peace agreement to resolve an ongoing self-determination conflict. After providing a brief overview of the dispute and its history, the draft agreement should address the contentious issues and theoretical perspectives covered in class: sovereignty, borders, identity/nationalism, international law, policy/interests, human rights/ethics, etc. Conclude by defending the proposal: How are sovereignty, borders, and identity issues addressed? Does resolution in one area have implications on the likelihood of resolution from another perspective—i.e. does resolving the legal claim also address the underlying ethical issues in that case?

Grading:

Class participation: 20%

Weekly assignments: 20%

Response paper and discussion questions: 20% (15% paper, 5% presentation/discussion)

Final paper: 40%

Readings:

All course readings are available on E-Reserves (accessible through Blackboard) or as handouts

Course Outline and Reading Assignments

Week 1 (September 9): Context, definitions, outcomes

Ted Robert Gurr and Monty G. Marshall. "Peace and Conflict 2003: A Global Survey of Armed Conflicts, Self-Determination Movements, and Democracy." College Park, MD: Center for International Development and Conflict Management, 2003. pp. 26-38 plus Table 2 and Table 3 in Appendix (pp. 57-69)

Hurst Hannum. *Autonomy, Sovereignty, and Self-Determination: The Accommodation of Conflicting Rights*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1990. Ch. 3, pp. 27-49

Wolfgang Danspeckgruber. "Self-determination, Self-governance, and Security." *International Relations* 15:1 (April 2000) pp. 11-21.

Week 2 (September 16): Ideal and principle

• **Past and contemporary problems**

John Waterbury. "Avoiding the Iron Cage of Legislated Communal Identity." Pp. 119-141 in Danspeckgruber, ed. *The Self-Determination of Peoples: Community, Nation and State in an Interdependent World*. Boulder and London: Lynne Rienner, 2002.

Margaret Moore. "The Territorial Dimension of Self-Determination." pp. 134-157 in Margaret Moore, Ed. *National Self-Determination and Secession*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998.

Ruth Lapidoth. "Sovereignty in Transition." *Journal of International Affairs* 45:2 (Winter 1992) pp. 325-346.

Week 3 (September 23): Historical perspectives

• **Nationalism, Wilson, and WWI**

Alfred Cobban. *The Nation-State and National Self-Determination*. London: Collins, 1969. pp. 23-84 (recommended: pp. 85-97)

Derek Heater. *National Self-Determination: Woodrow Wilson and His Legacy*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1994. pp. 28-52 (recommended: pp. 78-94).

Robert Lansing. *The Peace Negotiations: A Personal Narrative*. Boston and New York: Houghton Mifflin, 1921 pp. 93-105.

Week 4 (September 30): Legal framework

- **De-colonization, salt water theory, borders**

Helen Quane. "The United Nations and the Evolving Right to Self-Determination." *International and Comparative Law Quarterly* 47 (July 1998) pp. 537-572.

Lea Brilmayer. "Secession and Self-Determination: A Territorial Interpretation." *The Yale Journal of International Law* 16:1 (Winter 1991) pp. 177-202.

Michla Pomerance. *Self-Determination in Law and Practice: The New Doctrine in the United Nations*. The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, 1982. Chapters 3-5, pp. 16-37.

Week 5 (October 7): De-colonization and international law: Western Sahara

Anthony G. Pazzanita. "The Proposed Referendum in the Western Sahara: Background, Developments, and Prospects." pp. 187-226 in Yahia H. Zoubir and David Volman, eds. *International Dimensions of the Western Sahara Conflict*. Westport, CT: Praeger Press, 1993.

Thomas M. Franck. "The Stealing of the Sahara." *American Journal of International Law* 70:4 (October 1976) pp. 694-721.

Excerpts from the following Reports of the Secretary General to the UN Security Council:

S/2000/131 (paragraphs 15-36)

S/2001/613 (paragraphs 20-60)

S/2003/565 (paragraphs 23-60)—note: Peace Plan is Annex II of this document

Peace Plan for self-determination of the people of Western Sahara

Recommended:

"The United Nations Mission for the Referendum in Western Sahara." *The Blue Helmets: A Review of United Nations Peacekeeping*. New York: United Nations Department of Public Information, 1996. (excerpts available at http://www.un.org/Depts/DPKO/Missions/minurs_b.htm)

Week 6 (October 14): Ethical dimensions

- **Human rights, human security and humanitarian intervention**

Kofi A. Annan. "Two Concepts of Sovereignty." *The Economist* 18 September 1999, pp. 49-50.

UNDP Human Development Report 1994. Chapter 2: New Dimensions of Human Security, pp. 22-33. (definition and components of human security)

International Commission on Intervention and State Sovereignty. *The Responsibility to Protect*, Ottawa: International Development Research Center, 2001. pp. 1-19.

Robert McCorquodale. "Self-determination: A Human Rights Approach." *International and Comparative Law Quarterly* 43:4 (October 1994) pp. 857-885.

Allen Buchanan. "Self-Determination and the Right to Secede." *Journal of International Affairs* 45:2 (Winter 1992) pp. 347-365.

Recommended:

Tom Farer. "The Ethics of Intervention in Self-Determination Struggles." *Human Rights Quarterly* 25:2 (May 2003) pp. 382-406.

Week 7 (October 21): Human rights and intervention: Kosovo

Independent International Commission on Kosovo. *The Kosovo Report: International Law and Humanitarian Intervention* New York: Oxford University Press, 2000. Chapters 1-3, pp. 50-101. Recommended: Chapter 9, pp. 259-279

Patrick Thornberry. "'Come, friendly bombs...': International Law in Kosovo." pp. 43-57 in Michael Waller et. al., eds. *Kosovo: The Politics of Delusion*. London: Frank Cass, 2001.

Coral Bell. "Force, Diplomacy, and Norms." pp. 448-462 in Schnabel and Thakur, *Kosovo and the Challenge of Humanitarian Intervention: Selective Indignation, Collective Action, and International Citizenship* Tokyo, New York, Paris: UN University Press, 2000.

Interim Agreement for Peace and Self-Government in Kosovo (Rambouillet Agreement)

Recommended:

Marc Weller. "The Rambouillet Conference on Kosovo." *International Affairs* 75:2 (1999) pp. 211-251.

Week 8 (November 4): Policy considerations

- **Local politics, regional effects, and great power interests**

Jack Snyder and Karen Ballantine. "Nationalism and the Marketplace of Ideas." *International Security* 21: 2 (Autumn 1996) pp. 5-40.

Stephen Krasner. "Sovereignty and Intervention." pp. 228-249 in Lyons and Mastanduno, eds. *Beyond Westphalia? State Sovereignty and International Intervention*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1995.

Amitai Etzioni. "The Evils of Self-determination." *Foreign Policy* 89 (Winter 1992-93) pp. 21-35.

Week 9 (November 11): Economic and regional security: Nagorno-Karabakh

Stephan H. Astourian. "The Nagorno-Karabakh Conflict: Dimensions, Lessons, and Prospects." *Mediterranean Quarterly* 5:4 (Fall 1994) pp. 85-109.

Michael P. Croissant. *The Armenia-Azerbaijan Conflict: Causes and Implications*. Westport, CT: Praeger, 1998. Chapters 4-5, pp. 77-130.

Michael Mihalka. "Nagorno-Karabakh and Russian Peacekeeping: Prospects for a Second Dayton." *International Peacekeeping* 3:3 (Autumn 1996) pp. 16-32.

OSCE Minsk Co-Chairmanship: Comprehensive Agreement to Resolve the Nagorno-Karabakh Conflict (1997 draft agreement)

Recommended:

Levon Chorbajian, et al. *The Caucasian Knot: The History and Geopolitics of Nagorno-Karabakh*. London and New Jersey: Zed Books, 1994. pp. 1-48.

Week 10 (November 18): Conflict management

- **Role of International Community**

David A. Lake and Donald Rothchild. "Containing Fear: The Management of Transnational Ethnic Conflict." pp. 203-226 in Lake and Rothchild, eds. *The International Spread of Ethnic Conflict: Fear, Diffusion and Escalation*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998.

Chaim Kaufmann. "Possible and Impossible Solutions to Ethnic Civil Wars." *International Security*, Spring 1996, pp. 136-175.

Robert O. Keohane. "Political Authority after Intervention: Gradations in Sovereignty." pp. 275-298 in J. L. Holzgrefe and Robert O. Keohane, eds. *Humanitarian Intervention: Ethical, Legal and Political Dilemmas*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003.

Week 11 (December 2): Long-term solutions

- **Accommodation of minorities**

Steven R. Ratner. "Ethnic Conflict and Territorial Claims: Where Do We Draw a Line?" pp. 112-127 in David Wippman, ed. *International Law and Ethnic Conflict* Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1998.

OSCE document: The Lund Recommendations on the Effective Participation of National Minorities in Public Life

Asbjorn Eide. "Peaceful Group Accommodation as an Alternative to Secession in Sovereign States" pp. 87-110 in Clark and Williamson, Eds. *Self-Determination: International Perspectives*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1996.

International Crisis Group. *A Kosovo Roadmap (I): Addressing Final Status*. Balkans Report No. 124: 1 March 2002.

Jarat Chopra. "A Chance for Peace in Western Sahara." *Survival* 39:3 (Fall 1997) pp. 51-65.

Patricia Carley. "Nagorno-Karabakh: Searching for a Solution." United States Institute of Peace Roundtable Report: December 1998 (www.usip.org/pubs/pworks/pwrks25).

Week 12 (December 9): Future prospects?

- **Changing conceptions of identity, sovereignty, borders**

Kumar Rupesinghe. "Conflict Resolution: Current Options and New Mechanisms." pp. 337-354 in David Clark and Robert Williamson, eds. *Self-Determination: International Perspectives*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1996.

Gerry J. Simpson. "The diffusion of sovereignty: self-determination in the post-colonial age." *Stanford Journal of International Law* 32:2 (1996) pp. 255-286.

Wolfgang Danspeckgruber. "A Final Assessment" pp. 335-357 in Danspeckgruber, ed. *The Self-Determination of Peoples: Community, Nation and State in an Interdependent World* Boulder and London: Lynne Rienner, 2002.

Review the following:

International Crisis Group. *A Kosovo Roadmap (I): Addressing Final Status*. Balkans Report No. 124: 1 March 2002.

Jarat Chopra. "A Chance for Peace in Western Sahara." *Survival* 39:3 (Fall 1997) pp. 51-65.

Patricia Carley. "Nagorno-Karabakh: Searching for a Solution." United States Institute of Peace Roundtable Report: December 1998 (www.usip.org/pubs/pworks/pwrks25).